



Dialogue Report on the
“SouthAfrica Smallholder Farmers High level Consultation
on Gender, Agriculture policies and Budget 2018/19
in line with Malabo Declaration and Biennial report 2018”

6th December 2017, Birchwood Hotel, Johannesburg

Supported by



1. Introduction

ESAFF convened a small-scale farmers dialogue themed; “Multi country Smallholder Farmers consultation on Gender, Agriculture Policies and Budget 2018/19 in line with Malabo Declaration and Biennial reporting”. The event was held on 6th of December 2017 in Johannesburg – South Africa. It brought together 30 smallholder farmers, CAADP Focal Persons from Lesotho, South Africa and Swaziland (LSS) as well as ESAFF personnel from Tanzania.

The dialogue focused on the three countries performance in the agriculture sector, budget and gender as per the Malabo Biennial Reporting required by the African Union in January 2018.

The dialogue was organised by ESAFF Regional based in Tanzania with the support from the Southern Africa Trust (SAT) and Bread for the World (BfdW). One of the aims of the dialogue was to outline country progress in terms of the attainment of the 7 Malabo Declaration goals.



The conference was very enabling to farmers especially women and policy makers as the gender gaps that exist within the different countries came to light and action plans were made by each country. The dialogue also strengthened the advocacy spirit of farmers to push for change in national agriculture policies, budgets and promote accountability of government officials. The dialogue official opening and welcome note was done by the ESAFF Vice Chairperson, Mrs. Flora Maswanganyi (ESAFF RSA).



2. Relevance and objectives

The dialogue was organized with the purpose of the promotion of agriculture policy, plans and budget awareness in line with gender mainstreaming in South Africa. The event also was instrumental in providing input to the process of finalizing agriculture sector budgets, plans and programmes for implementation in 2018/19. The three countries national budgets expected to be tabled in early 2018. The dialogue exposed the gaps that were existed in terms of the participation of women and the youth in policy formulation, planning and budgeting of the agriculture sector at grassroots, LSS national and SADC regional level. Action plans were laid down for future follow-ups. In a nutshell the dialogue aimed at the following points:

- Equip smallholder farmers with basic knowledge and skills related to agriculture policies, plans, budgets, programme implementation and monitoring with smallholder and gender lenses.
- Orient participants on National and SADC commitments in the area of agriculture and food security with gender perspectives and their performances per the current Biennial Reporting:
- Familiarize farmers with importance to participate at regional, national and district level in issues related to agriculture policies, plans and budgets
- Equip smallholder farmers with basic knowledge and skills related to agriculture policies, plans and budget 2018/19
- Determine and map actions to further influence plans, budgets, programme implementation at regional, national and district level.

Small-scale farmers

Presentations and Discussions



3. Presentation on Agriculture policy frameworks at AU, SADC (RAIP) and National level

A presentation on the Agriculture policy frameworks at continental level, SADC and national level was done by ESAFF Coordinator as the SADC Regional Agriculture Policy (RAP) Coordinator, Mr. Martin Muchero could not attend as he had another commitment.

In his presentation, Mr Joe Mzinga said agriculture influence economic growth in the region and can help millions of people to overcome poverty. He said that the study by the Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO) of the UN concluded that the **agriculture sector can alleviate poverty 11 times** more than other sectors including oil and gas or mining and services (*The State of Food Insecurity in the World 2012*).



Joe Mzinga, ESAFF Coordinator

He highlighted the general outlook of the continent, and the importance of agriculture for SADC in terms of *Food security, Nutrition status and Poverty alleviation and wealth creation*. He stated that 292 million people are homed in the SADC and 61 % live in rural areas and depend on agriculture for livelihood. SADC has the potential to feed the continent. About 25.1 million people (8% of the total population) of the SADC are vulnerable to food insecurity with one meal per day. Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Lesotho, Malawi, South Africa and Zimbabwe have high numbers of food insecure people.

He further highlighted that despite the policies and programmes being implemented across the continent, there is evidence of stunting and malnutrition in SADC. Malnutrition and stunting rates continue to quadruple. That the majority of the SADC Member States (**12 out of 15**) have stunting rates above **20%**, The level deemed as unacceptable by the World Health Organisation (WHO). **DRC, Malawi, Mozambique, and Zambia** have severely high stunting rates of above **40%**, while Lesotho and **the United Republic of Tanzania (URT)** also have high rates of malnutrition of between **30% and 40%**.

He then explained about the Agriculture Policy Frameworks *at Global, Continental, Regional, National and Grassroots Level*. He emphasized how goal 1 & 2 of the global Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are tied to agriculture and reiterated their importance. He made mention of the Agenda 2030 and the goals we want to have achieved in Africa by then. He spoke of the Malabo Declaration and emphasised goal 2 which is more on



finance investment. He said many countries have not reached the 10% budget allocation annually to the sector and even the small that is allocated, there are challenges in some countries to realise in full budget. He cited examples in some countries where less than 20% of the budgeted was only disbursed.

SADC RAP and RAIP Priority Programmes were outlined, the focus of the SADC agricultural policies is tied directly to National agricultural policies. The even RAIP investment instruments were also highlighted such as the Value Chains, disaster preparedness, etc.

The Malabo Commitment to Agriculture, June 2016



1. Recommitment to the Principles and Values of the CAADP Process
2. Recommitment to enhance investment finance in Agriculture
 - Uphold 10% public spending target
 - Operationalization of Africa Investment Bank
3. Commitment to Ending Hunger by 2025
 - At least double productivity (focusing on Inputs, irrigation, mechanization)
 - Reduce PHL at least by half
 - Nutrition: reduce stunting to 10%
4. Commitment to Halving Poverty, by 2025, through inclusive Agricultural Growth and Transformation
 - Sustain Annual sector growth in Agricultural GDP at least 6%
 - Establish and/or strengthen inclusive public-private partnerships for at least five (5) priority agricultural commodity value chains with strong linkage to smallholder agriculture.
 - Create job opportunities for at least 30% of the youth in agricultural value chains.
5. Commitment to Boosting Intra-African Trade in Agricultural Commodities and services
 - Triple intra-Africa trade in agricultural commodities
 - Fast track continental free trade area & transition to a continental Common External tariff scheme.
6. Commitment to Enhancing Resilience in livelihoods & production systems to climate variability and other shocks
7. Commitment to Mutual Accountability to Actions and Results

These commitments and targets were approved by the Heads of State and Government of the African Union, in their Assembly in Malabo, Equatorial Guinea, 26 - 27 June 2014

On the SADC Regional Agriculture Policy (SADC RAP), Food and Nutrition Security Strategy (FNSS) and The Regional Agriculture Investment Plan (RAIP), he said the SADC Development fund is set to enhance self-sustenance, however only 7 Member States have so far signed the agreement on the operationalisation of the fund. He added that no country had deposited instruments of ratification with the Secretariat with Mauritius indicating its willingness to sign.

The 7 countries that have signed the SADC fund agreement are Angola, DRC, Lesotho, Mozambique, Swaziland, Tanzania and Zimbabwe.

He then, posed three key questions to the small-scale farmers;

- Can SADC fully realise Malabo Declaration by 2025?
- What would be the role of small scale farmers in the push for the realisation of the Malabo goals?
- What are the opportunities to influence agriculture policy plans, policies and budgets?

4. National Presentation on Small scale farmers' involvement in Agriculture Policies, Plans and Budgets issues: Involvement and challenges with gender lenses.

The presentations started with a role-play presented by the farmers of each respective country before national coordinators could begin. The brief role-play was highlighted all about outlining the journey that the farmers went through when doing Public Expenditure Tracking Survey (PETS) and dealing with government officials in their countries. The key message sent by the role-play was the exposure of challenges that still limit women farmers in South Africa.



4.1 ESAFF South Africa

The presentation by Mr. Jan Malema, ESAF RSA Coordinator and the role play by farmers highlighted the activities undertaken by ESAFF SA during the year of 2017. PETS different issues were pinpointed by SSF in Limpopo like electricity where farmers were charged exorbitant costs of consumption of power by SSF and a letter was written to NERSA to tackle issue of charging to farmers, Fetsa-Tlala program-distribution of seed support i.e Mopani, Giyani the seed distributed without discussion with farmers, the seed were dropped at chief's place till the season period was passed and ageing farming community as youth are not taking part farming.

Challenges

- Access to information at Limpopo- same to websites of relevant government departments don't popularise any information regarding to CAADAP,
- Gender discrimination in terms on inheritance some women are still not allowed to own land when the husband has passed away (gender mainstream is important)
- Involvement of SSF participating in budgeting processes there is a gap in terms of access of information, abuse of power by chiefs and headmen-community conflicts, support to SSF is limited i.e. department of Agri need to consider the contribution food security of SSF as SSF are feeding the community.



Mr. Jan Malema –ESAFF RSA

Way forward;

- Small scale farmers noted that the budget of agriculture is low for the year 2018 was 2.8% but had belief that it can be increased a little bit more and can help to sustain the SSF,
- Requested for a draft country agriculture sector calendar which can shows meetings from district levels will help farmers to participate in plenary meetings for the Department of Agriculture,
- Department of Agriculture to help in electricity billing esp. to SSF as billing are very high compare to the usage.
- Undermine women in a sense that even calling a meeting needs to include husband/men to open the event (Introductory meeting in RSA)

The Malabo Commitment to Agriculture, June 2016



1. **Recommitment to the Principles and Values of the CAADP Process**
2. **Recommitment to enhance investment finance in Agriculture**
 - Uphold 10% public spending target
 - Operationalization of Africa Investment Bank
3. **Commitment to Ending Hunger by 2025**
 - At least double productivity (focusing on Inputs, irrigation, mechanization)
 - Reduce PHL at least by half
 - Nutrition: reduce stunting to 10%
4. **Commitment to Halving Poverty, by 2025, through inclusive Agricultural Growth and Transformation**
 - Sustain Annual sector growth in Agricultural GDP at least 6%
 - Establish and/or strengthen inclusive public-private partnerships for at least five (5) priority agricultural commodity value chains with strong linkage to smallholder agriculture.
 - Create job opportunities for at least 30% of the youth in agricultural value chains.
 - Preferential entry & participation by women and youth in gainful and attractive agribusiness
5. **Commitment to Boosting Intra-African Trade in Agricultural Commodities and services**
 - Triple intra-Africa trade in agricultural commodities
 - Fast track continental free trade area & transition to a continental Common External tariff scheme.
6. **Commitment to Enhancing Resilience in livelihoods & production systems to climate variability and other shocks**
7. **Commitment to Mutual Accountability to Actions and Results**

These commitments and targets were approved by the Heads of State and Government of the African Union, in their Assembly in Malabo, Equatorial Guinea, 26 - 27 June 2014

CAADP FOCAL PERSONS

Presentations and Discussions on the

**National Agriculture Food and Nutrition Security Programs (NAFSPs)
performance against the 7 Malabo Declaration Goals and Biennial
Reporting**



4 Country presentation on National Agriculture Food and Nutrition Security Programs (NAFSPs) performance against the 7 Malabo Declaration Goals and Biennial Reporting.

5.1 South Africa and Malabo Implementation – by Winston Mabanyane, CAADP Focal Point Presentation:



Mr. W. Makabanyane, Department of Agriculture RSA

Report on the performance of the agriculture in South Africa and the achievements towards reaching the 7 Malabo goals was presented by Mr. Winston Makamanyane from the department of Agriculture in South Africa. He explained that CAADP is about change and change needs champions. To change is difficult, that is why we need champions in ESAFF to change the mind-set of people. If we change, we must work with other people whether be ESAFF, government or any other organization.

Planning must be a value adding process. ESAFF SA must have a footprint in all the provinces to be heard in the national level and in so doing you will make government accountable. If you have the strength you will be able to contribute to the plans tabled. In Mpumalanga, we have good production but we are competing with coal mining, as to show how South Africa is not reaching the 10% mark in agricultural investment due to stiff competition with more productive sectors such as mining.

He added that farmers need to engage the government that you want the agricultural land to be protected by law so that even if someone comes with millions to invest in mining on agricultural land, the law will protect you.

He told a brief story of a farmer in Eastern Cape province who produced 4Ha of Maize without irrigation but never sold any part of the produce, because there was no infrastructure (road) to move the produce. He then asked the farmers, if government should put 10% in agriculture or invest in infrastructure that will complement and support agriculture. From the perspective of the PETS result he said we rather engage government (Department of Energy) to subsidise electricity so that farmers would be able to produce than put 10%. We should instruct the government as farmers on the direction and we must see the value where the government puts money. The reason why SA has not signed is because of the multiple support to agriculture through different government departments, by so saying it easy to think that South Africa is further away from the 10% but in reality, we exceed it because multiple government departments directly fund agriculture.

Performance categories and the current standing of SA

PTI: National CAADP process and involvement of other non-state actors- Not on track. Refer to the caption in the presentation.

South Africa have the best CAADP policies in Africa, however, farmers are not transparent in terms of information provision i.e. some farms are registered as household. Farmers are not organized and that is why the government is delivering inputs at the homes of chiefs, because farmers are not organized enough to instruct government where to deliver. On Social protection: South Africa have social grants, school feeding but these are not sustainable. In terms of Food security and nutrition, SA is at the national level but when looking at the statistics it is worse than Lesotho and Swaziland. SA is number among with high level of stunting in Africa and we have an issue of obesity, which makes two opposites of health issues.

In terms of mutual accountability SA scored 4.1% as SA, and as SADC scored 3.1. Mr. Makabanyane said that RSA was expected to score 3.9 so if your country is at 3.9 or more then you have exceeded expectation in terms of CAADP.

Presentations and Discussions on the National Agriculture Budget Priorities for the year 2018 and main beneficiaries



6 Presentations on 3 national budgets 2018/19 and priorities

The presentations were done by the CAADP Focal Persons with respect to their country of representations.

6.2 South Africa 2018/19 budget priorities

The CAADP Focal Point for South Africa, Mr. Winston Makabanyane didn't have the budget line for 2018/19 because the national budget does not reflect what is going on in the province, province have their own budget line and the government does not always follow their plans. He thus, gave an assignment to ESAFF to hold the government accountable when they don't follow the national plans.

He then pointed out that the farmers need to encourage the government to increase the share of Agricultural Spending and see how the share in agricultural GDP reacts. To strengthen his argument, he then made a brief reflection on the history of government spending towards agriculture. He said that between the year 1930 and 1940 there was a spike in government spending that may have been triggered by the rise in the mining sector or by the great depression or the Boers in parliament.

Again in 1950 there was climate change and that made research a necessity for new crops and animal breeds thus there was a spike in government spending on agriculture. From 1930 and 1950 SA had more money because it was industrializing, and that is why the Head of States in the formulation of CAADP said put in the 10% so that you can industrialize. He added that, when country is industrializing will need more money and once that goal has been achieved then spending will decline because the goal has been reached. The amount that goes in agriculture is increasing, in 2002 it was R4 billion and in 2015 it was R16 billion. This shows that the budget is increasing and agriculture is adding value to the economy.

He then raised concern that farmers are a bit resistant to government data collections and that impacts on the spending of government towards agriculture. He mentioned that there is more information available but OUTSTANDING data from commercial sector that can contribute to the CAADP report. If the CAADP team can know this information then we can inform the allocation of the budget, because we would know where there is disparity in the value chain and to which people is the budget going to benefit. Mr Makabanyane previously had opinion with regard the requirement and farmers cry for the 10% budgetary annual allocation to agriculture. He added that South Africa as a country must have an investment plan, look at the resources they have and the opportunities that are there. The country must look at where there can be more benefits, more jobs and better contribution to the economy and that doesn't have to be agriculture but it can be any other sector. You cannot just put 10% where you don't see the returns. SA is averaging at 1.8% of the budget. SA agriculture contributes 2.3% to the GDP. For every R1.80 spent on agriculture you get R2.30 which is 50 cents returns. He then advised that government must put more money on agriculture and see if we will get more returns. The government must put in more money until the returns start to decline.

Another issue with SA is that as much as the economy is big, it is not benefitting a lot of people. 2015/16 the budget was R2 trillion. R20 billion is the 1.8% and that is more than the GDP of the economies of many African economies. So, if you put 10% in Agriculture then the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (DAFF) will not be able to absorb the money. Hence, more money must be put on the sector that will benefit the economy.

Areas for improvement

- There is no categorisation of farmers, the farming community of Lesotho is still generalized as small-scale farmers.
- Market access: parliament issued a directive for Government MKT institutions to buy local produce first. Under school feeding programme they also follow the same directive,
- Farmers in Lesotho are, at all levels involved in the development of policies and strategies. But, lately because of budget constraints the ministry had to scale down on number of participants in stakeholder consultation.
- The budget has increased a lot in terms of government projects, and as officials have anticipated challenges in the aspect of capacity which makes the performance not to look very impressive.

The presentation from the 3 CAADP Focal Points of Lesotho, Swaziland and South Africa were followed by a session of deliberations.

Deliberations on South Africa



The CAADP Focal Point of South Africa in response to a comment made by a farmer on mines within communities said that mines and Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), differs from community to community other communities use that very well and this is caused by the management style of the community. Some communities are not using the CSR in a beneficial way. For example, he made mention of Bafokeng community which is considered the richest in Africa because the chief planned with the community he practiced CAADP. In developing the village, they developed based on what already existed, they did not start a new thing but they improved on what they have. They began with investment in education. The management style and the management resolve can lead to better use of funds of CSR. Sometimes, resources are mismatched with the NDP 2030 because it states that agriculture must lead the economy. The CAADP Focal Point mentioned that his team is conducting studies on farmer profitability, and their results will be evidence on the development of investment plans. It will be presented to treasury to show the disparity so that they increase agricultural budget.

The session of deliberations on the national budgets of the 3 countries were concluded and the country group discussions began to formulate a way forward for each country.

Country group discussion, Way forward and Action plans

What can we do to improve agriculture budget priorities and expenditure in LSS countries from 2018/19 onwards.



7. Country group discussions, Way forward and Action plans

After country group work, farmers from each country with their CAADP focal person had discussions on what should be done to improve agriculture budget plans, budget and expenditure from 2018/19 onwards. The following are the action plans agreed by each country:

7.1 Farmers from ESAFF South Africa

- Looking for and identify allies to work with
- Know how all the government spheres work at all levels from grassroots provincial and national
- The need to ask for a calendar stipulating all the major processes relating to budgeting and planning.
- Creation of personal relationships within government offices at all levels
- Work with CPRD, EPWP, SGB, NERSA
- Organise and equip farmers of ESAFF SA to take part inclusively on government budgeting processes.
- Organize ESAFF SA to be part of CEO Forum and MEC and Ministers Forum



8. In Conclusion

In conclusion, the small-scale farmers were urged to be proactive and continue to make the government accountable. Farmers were encouraged to work harder to contribute to the growth of the economy make relationships with the governments, work hard to build those relationships. It was added they must not work in isolation and must organise so that the government can take them serious. The CAADP Focal Points were humbled by the value that ESAFF see in them as country CAADP FP and they further added that if ESAFF and SAT continue with such forums then a lot will be learnt and a lot will come out. Lastly the farmers were hinted with the saying that *“You cannot change the way government work, but rather know how it works to influence it. Government officials must not get tired of CAADP, what we must know is that change takes time”*. ESAFF Regional was once more commended by the small-scale farmers and CAADP FP on the exemplary leadership to its country members, and urged to continue to nurture the growth of its country members.

Annex I. TIMETABLE

6 th December 2017		
Time	Activity	Lead persons
8:00 – 08:30	Arrival and registration and Socialisation	Joe Mzinga Irene N
	Objectives of the event - Why we are here and self-Introductions	
Time	Activity	Lead persons
8:30 – 08:45	Welcome opening Ceremony	ESAFF Vice Chairperson
Session 1 08:45-09:30	Brief presentation on Agriculture policy frameworks at AU, SADC (RAIP) and National level	Joe Mzinga
Session 2 9:30-10:30	Small scale farmers involvement in Agriculture Policies, Plans and Budgets issues -Involvement and challenges with gender lenses (National presentations)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Maswati Dlodlu• Lesotho• Jan Malema
10:30-11:00	TEA BREAK AND GROUP PHOTO	Lead persons
Session 3 11:00-13:00	National presentations on NAFSAPs performance against BRN in reaching 7 Malabo goals and Wayward	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• CAADAP Focal person Swaziland• Focal Person South Africa• Focal Person Lesotho
13.00 - 14.00	LUNCH	Lead persons
Session 4 14.00-15.30	Presentation on 3 national budgets 2018/19 and priorities (what's in stock for smallholder farmers Discussion and way forward	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• CAADAP Focal person Swaziland• Focal Person South Africa• Focal Person Lesotho
15:30-16:00	Country group work and presentation on countries way forward on engaging agriculture budget planning, implementation and monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Maswati Dlodlu• Lesotho• Jan Malema
16:00-1615	closing remarks	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• CAADP Focal Person RSA

Annex ii. Participants List

S/N	PARTICIPANT NAME	COUNTRY	CONTACT
1	Mathoriso Molumeli	LESOTHO	Mathorisomm@gmail.com
2	Maswati Dludlu	SWAZILAND	esaffswaziland@gmail.com
3	Tshehlakgolo Issac Thobejang	SOUTH AFRICA	0799 110612
4	Mauthatisc Mosaunyane	LESOTHO	026658934524
5	Matsonk Setarumane	LESOTHO	06658783993
6	Tandazani Sibiya	SWAZILAND	268 76248197
7	Gloria Prindite Dlamini	SWAZILAND	768371621
8	Zinwe Simelane	SWAZILAND	78147268
9	Thoko Langwenya	SWAZILAND	26876274271
10	Maserelo Mahasa	LESOTHO	26658912505
11	Chalimo Mathaba	LESOTHO	26665000020
12	Mamhati Ntlhannboe	LESOTHO	26651767454
13	Mathebula H J Hlengani	SOUTH AFRICA	mzukuya@gmail.com
14	Malema Jan	SOUTH AFRICA	malemam@outlook.com
15	W. Itumelang Makabanye	SOUTH AFRICA	0123197021
16	Maria Mathole	SOUTH AFRICA	0792573854
17	Diketso Letshelesente	SOUTH AFRICA	0769063343
18	Jackson Kadiaka	SOUTH AFRICA	pholoshong@gmail.com
19	Fakudze Ntombikayise	SWAZILAND	esaffswaziland@gmail.com
20	Sukati Ncamsile	SWAZILAND	sukatincamsile@gmail.com
21	Titlis Klabela	SWAZILAND	26876243680
22	Mamalefehsane Phakoe	LESOTHO	mariamphakmal@gmail.com
23	Mathabiso Khechane	LESOTHO	Matselisophakoe1@gmail.com
24	Maswanganyi Florah	SOUTH AFRICA	0738612991
25	Valet Masinge	SOUTH AFRICA	0731395431
26	Dumsan N Spamin	SWAZILAND	26876956536
27	Stella M Henry	TANZANIA	Stellamaghali87@gmail.com
28	Irene Ngao	TANZANIA	0785340538
29	Joe Mzinga	TANZANIA	Cordnator@esaff.org
30	Lejune Maroa	LESOTHO	